

Technical Evaluation Report

HIRING OF CONSULTING FIRM FOR CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR THE PROJECT “DETAILED STUDY ON DETERMINATION OF COST OF PRODUCTION/ MINIMUM INDICATIVE PRICES OF TOBACCO”



Pakistan Tobacco Board
Ministry of National Food Security & Research
وزارت برائے قومی تحقیق و حفظانِ تغذیہ، پاکستان

December, 2022

**Deputy Director Marketing
Pakistan Tobacco Board (PTB)**

**Ministry of National Food Security & Research
GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN**

Table of Contents

Contents

Section I.	Technical Evaluation Report—Text.....	3
Section II.	Technical Evaluation Report—Forms.....	7
	Form IIA. Technical Evaluation - Basic Data.....	8
	Form IIB. Evaluation Summary.....	11
 Section III. Annex.		
Annex I.	Minutes of Opening of Technical Proposals	—
Annex I.	Minutes of the meeting for evaluation of Technical Proposals	—

Section I. Technical Evaluation Report-Text

1. Objective of the Assignment

Pakistan Tobacco Board (PTB) has been established under Pakistan Tobacco Board Ordinance, 1968 (I of 1968) mainly to regulate, control and promote cultivation and export of tobacco and tobacco products and to undertake research in tobacco and develop new tobacco growing areas. Under Section 8 of PTB Ordinance 1968, the Minimum Indicative Prices (MIPs) for different grades of various types of tobacco are to be notified by the Federal Government. The Prices & Grade Revision Committee constituted under Bye-Law No. 11(1,2) of PTB Bye-Laws 1985, recommends the prices for various types of tobacco for different areas. As per Bye-law 11 of PTB Bye-laws 1985, the work of Prices & Grade Revision Committee shall be preceded by the process of determination of Cost of Production (CoP).

PTB intends to hire Consulting Firms/Organizations to conduct a study titled “Detailed Study on determination of Cost of Production/Minimum Indicative Prices of tobacco”.

The prospective firm is expected to provide technical assistance in the following areas:

- To assess/evaluate the current process of assessment/determination of CoP of Flue Cured Virginia (FCV) tobacco and Dark Air Cured (DAC) tobacco in selected districts (Swabi, Mardan, Charsadda, Mansehra and Buner in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Mianwali, Gujrat, Mandi Bahauddin and Okara districts in Punjab);
- To identify and analyze the gap(s), if any, in the current process of determination of CoP;
- To study the existing process of determination of CoP in other crops and compare the same with the process of determination of CoP of tobacco crop;
- To study and evaluate the current questionnaire for determining CoP of tobacco;
- To develop a comprehensive questionnaire, in view of deficiencies in the current process observed during the course of study and compare the same with international best practices of similar model(s);
- To identify and analyze the causes of short comings in the current process of determination of CoP of tobacco, if any;
- To develop a comprehensive and transparent model for assessment/determination of CoP of tobacco in future;
- To identify the sample frame of new model;

- Any other activity conducive to the above.

2. The Selection Process (Prior to Technical Evaluation)

For pre-selection/shortlisting of eligible and qualified Consulting Firms to provide consultancy services on “Detailed Study on determination of Cost of Production/ Minimum Indicative Prices of tobacco”, Request for Expressions of Interest (REOI) was advertised in leading National Dailies namely; The News, Daily Mashriq, Daily Quaid and Daily Jihad, on 30-07-2022 as well as on websites: www.ptb.gov.pk and www.ppra.org.pk. Deadline for submission of Expression of Interest was **15-08-2022** at **1500 hours** through courier or in person in Pakistan Tobacco Board, Peshawar. In response, only one consulting firm “M/S HLB IJAZ TABASSUM & CO.” submitted its EOI and the Procurement Evaluation Committee in its meeting held on 18-08-2022 decided to follow the procedure of re-advertisement in stipulated period of time.

5. Same procedure was adopted for 2nd time invitation of EOIs and deadline for submission of Expression of Interest was **08-09-2022** at **1500 hours** through courier or in person in Pakistan Tobacco Board, Peshawar.

6. In response to REOI notice, five (5) Consulting Firms as per details hereunder (Table – 1) submitted their REOI responses within the due date & time.

Table. 1

Sr. No	Name of Consulting Firm	Status
1	M/S HLB IJAZ TABASSUM & CO.	Consultancy
2	M/S ASB/IPSOS	Consultancy
3	M/S KHAITY	Consultancy
4	M/S NIELSON IQ	Consultancy
5	M/S RAFAQAT BABAR & CO.	Consultancy

The National Competitive Bidding (NCB) Procedure and “Quality & Cost Based Selection (QCBS) Method” as per Public Procurement Regulations for Procurement of Consulting Services, 2010 shall be followed for hiring of Consulting Firm. The Technical & Financial Proposals are carrying **80%** and **20%** weights, respectively.

The EOIs were subsequently evaluated by the designated Procurement Evaluation Committee (PEC). As a result of shortlisting, following Three (03) Firms (Table – 2) were issued Request for Proposal (RFP) for submission of their technical and Financial Proposals by 16th November, 2022.

Table. 2

Sr. No	Name of Consulting Firm	Status
1	M/S HLB IJAZ TABASSUM & CO.	Consultancy
2	M/S ASB/IPSOS	Consultancy
3	M/S NIELSON IQ	Consultancy

The shortlisted Firms were issued the RFP on 31st October, 2022 and a Pre-proposal conference was held on 8th November, 2022 to provide clarifications on queries/questions raised by the participating representatives of the firms on Request for Proposal (RFP) document to facilitate them in preparation of technical and financial proposals.

On the due date & time of receipt of proposals i.e. 16th November, 2022 by or before 1330 hours amongst three (03) shortlisted Firms, all three Firms submitted their technical and financial proposals:

3. Technical Evaluation

1. The designated “Procurement Evaluation Committee” met on 16th November, 2022 at 1500 hours in the Conference Room, Pakistan Tobacco Board, Head office, Peshawar (*Minutes of the opening of Technical Proposal are attached as Annex-I of Section III*) in presence of the representatives of Firms who chose to be present.
2. The names of the participating Firms were read out loudly. Subsequently, the PEC handed over the Financial Proposals of the participating Firms to Secretary PTB for safe custody.
3. The proposals of two firms “HLB Ijaz Tabassum & Co.” and “Ipsos in Pakistan” were according to “single stage two envelope procedure” as mentioned in RFP while the proposal of Nielson IQ was not as per criteria i.e financial information was provided in technical proposal.
4. PEC carried out evaluation of Technical Proposals in accordance with the laid down criteria of the approved RFP and the TORs.
5. PEC finalized technical evaluation in its meeting held on 05-12-2022 (*Minutes of the opening of Technical Proposal are attached as Annex-II of Section III*). As financial proposal of Nielson IQ was not sealed in separate envelope. It was unanimously decided to reject the technical proposal submitted by NielsonIQ due to non-compliance of PPRA rules, 2004, 36 (b) i & ii as well as RFP document.
6. Summary of evaluation of Technical Proposals is as under: -

Table.3

S #	Names of Firms	Technical scores
1	HLB IJAZ TABASSUM & CO	84.50
2	ASB/IPSOS in Pakistan	80.33

7. Based on the results of the evaluation mentioned above, the Firms obtaining technical scores of **75 or more** stand technically qualified for opening of their Financial Proposal.

Section II. Technical Evaluation Report—Forms

Form IIA. Technical Evaluation—Basic Data

Form IIB. Evaluation Summary—Technical Scores/Ranking

Section II. Technical Evaluation Report—Forms

Form IIA. Technical Evaluation - Basic Data

- 2.1 Name of country Islamic Republic of Pakistan
- 2.2 Client:
 (a) name Pakistan Tobacco Board
 (b) address, phone Ministry of National Food Security & Research,
 Government of Pakistan
 46 B Office Enclave Phase 5 Hayatabad,
 Peshawar, Pakistan,
 Phone: - +92(91) 17833.
 Email: ddmkteting@ptb.gov.pk
- 2.3 Type of assignment (pre-investment, preparation, or implementation), and brief description of sources Hiring of consulting firm for consultancy services for “Detailed study on determination of cost of production/minimum indicative price of tobacco”
- 2.4 Method of selection: Quality & Cost Based Selection (QCBS) (80:20)
- 2.5 Request for expressions of interest:
 (a) publication on Public Procurement Authority Website Yes (1st 30th July, 2022)
 (b) publication in national newspaper(s) Yes (1st 30th July, 2022)
 (c) publication in international newspaper(s) N/A
 (d) number of responses Five (05) responses
- 2.6 Shortlisted Consulting Firms:
- | Sr. # | Consulting Firms (Single/Joint venture/Consortium) |
|-------|--|
| 1. | HLB IJAZ TABASSUM & CO. |
| 2. | ASB/IPSOS in Pakistan |
| 3 | NIELSONIQ |
- 2.7 Request for Proposals:
 (a) First issuance to Firms Date: 31st October, 2022
 (b) Second issuance, if any Not Applicable
- 2.8 Amendments and clarifications to the RFP (describe) No
- 2.9 Contract Type: Lumpsum – Deliverable based
- 2.10 Pre-proposal conference:
 (a) First Conference Yes (8th November, 2022)
- 2.11 Proposal submission:

- (a) one envelope (Technical) Two envelopes (Technical and Financial proposals in separate sealed envelopes)
- (b) original submission Date: 15th November, 2022 Time: 1500 hrs
- (d) extensions(s) Date: 16th November, 2022 Time: 1330 hrs
- 2.12 Submission of Financial Proposal Location: Deputy Director (Marketing)
Pakistan Tobacco Board, Ministry of National Food Security & Research, Government of Pakistan,
46 B Office Enclave Phase 5 Hayatabad, Peshawar.
- 2.13 Opening of Technical Proposals by selection committee Date: 16th November, 2022 Time 1330 hours
- 2.14 Number of proposals submitted Three (03) Proposals Received
- 2.15 (a) Procurement Evaluation Committee: Members' names and titles
Dr. Qaizar Ahmed, Secretary (PTB)- **Convener**
Mr. Muhammad Khurram Jamshaid, Deputy Food Security Commissioner I, MoNFS&R, Islamabad- **Member**
Mr. Muhammad Zubair, Financial Management Specialist (PPDU), Ministry of Water Resources, Islamabad- **Member**
Mr. Rizwan Ullah, Assistant Director (B&F), PTB- **Member**
Jalal Ud Din, Director Marketing, Agri. Extension, Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa- **Member**
Dr. Hafiz Abdul Samad Tahir, Deputy Director (Marketing) PTB- **Secretary/Member**
- 2.16 Proposal validity period (days):
(a) original expiration date 180 days
(b) extension(s), if any 14-05-2022

2.17 Evaluation Criteria/sub-criteria:

Sr. #	Criterion	Points
1.	General Experience of the Consultant (i.e. Length of Incorporation as Company/firm or Registration/Licensing, General Assignments etc.)	10
2.	Specific experience of the Consultant (as a firm) relevant to the Assignment (3 Projects similar to the assignment) Please provide the relevant (similar, specific or related experiences) assignments/works, duly substantiated, completed by the Firm/Joint	10

	<p>venture, with the following details:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Name of the Project b. Cost of the Project c. Name and address of the Client d. If case of association of service providers, the names and address of all the partners e. Start & Completion Date f. Number of staff-months provided by the firm (in case of association/JV, by other partner firms) g. Brief description of the services rendered 	
3.	<p>Adequacy and quality of the proposed methodology, and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference (TORs)</p> <p>The number of points to be assigned to the following sub-criteria and relevant weights:</p>	45
3.1	<p><u>Methodology</u></p> <p>[It will be assessed as to whether the proposed methodology is clear, responds to all the components and requirements of the TORs]</p>	<u>25</u>
3.1.1	Performance Assessment Planning and Methodology	06
3.1.2	Tools for analysis of Administrative Environment and governance structure of technically complex organization	05
3.1.3	Feasibility studies and surveys conducted	06
3.1.4	Approach for backstopping/technical support for the implementation of the approved implementation mechanism	04
3.1.5	Tools for establishing cost/feasibility studies or farmer's surveys system	04
3.2	<p><u>Staffing Plan</u></p> <p>[Overall team composition is balanced, appropriately deployed and has adequate qualifications & skills mix; and the work plan has rational inputs of Experts]</p>	<u>10</u>
3.3	<p><u>Work Plan</u></p> <p>[It will be assessed that work plan is responding to the given timelines of the client, realistic, implementable and covering all the aspects/components of service delivery]</p>	<u>10</u>
4.	<p>Key Experts' qualifications and competence for the Assignment:</p>	35
	<p>The number of points to be assigned to each of the below positions or disciplines shall be determined considering the following sub criteria and relevant percentage weights:</p>	

(a)	Qualification	20%
(b)	General Experience	20%
(C)	Specific Experience related to the assignment/project	60%
4.1	Team Leader/Project Director Ph.D. in Statistics with 3 years' experience or M.S./M.Sc. in Statistics with 10 years' experience in the Data statistical modeling.	10
4.2	Senior Analyst M.Phil. in Statistics/Agricultural Economics/Economics with at least 5 years' experience in data analysis modeling	05
4.3	Data Expert MS in Computer Science or in a related field with minimum 5 years' experience in data management. S/he shall possess knowledge of managing and optimizing crops related data	05
4.4	Field Team Supervisor B.Sc. (Hons) in Agriculture with 5 years' experience as field supervisor	05
4.5	Field Coordinator Diploma in Agriculture with 5 years' experience as data collector	05
4.6	Cost Accountant ACMA/CA qualified with 5 years' experience in costing & financial reporting	05
Total Points =		100

Form IIB. Evaluation Summary—Technical Scores/Ranking

2.18 Technical scores of the Firms

S #	Names of Firms	Technical scores
1	HLB IJAZ TABASSUM & CO	84.50
2	ASB/IPSOS	80.33

2.19 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

At the Expression of Interest stage, three (3) Firms were shortlisted for issuance of Request for Proposals (RFP) document. RFPs received from all three firms.

The proposals of “HLB Tabassum & Co.” and “Ipsos in Pakistan” were according to “single stage two envelope procedure” as mentioned in RFP while the proposal of Nielson IQ was not as per criteria. The financial proposal of Nielson IQ was not sealed in separate envelope. It was unanimously decided to reject the technical proposal submitted by NielsonIQ due to non compliance of PPRA rules, 2004, 36 (b) i & ii.

HLB Tabassum & Co. and Ipsos in Pakistan qualified by scoring 84.50 & 80.33 marks respectively.

The minimum threshold for qualification in the technical proposal was set as 75 marks out of 100 in the RFP documents. The Procurement Evaluation Committee recommends that both the firms have been qualified for next stage of the procurement process i.e. to open the financial proposal of the firms in the presence of their representatives.

2.20 CERTIFICATION

All members of the Committee hereby certified that they have no Conflict of Interest in the evaluation process.

Dr. Qaizar Ahmed
Secretary,
PTB, Peshawar
Convener

M. Khurram Jamshid
D.F.S Commissioner-I,
Ministry of National Food
Security & Research,
Islamabad.
Member

Dr. H.A Samad Tahir
DD (Marketing)
PTB, Peshawar
Secretary/Member

Jalal Ud Din
Director Marketing
Agri. Extension, Department
Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
Member

Muhammad Zubair,
Financial Management Specialist
(PPDU), Water Resources Division,
Ministry of Water Resources,
Islamabad.
Member

Rizwan Ullah
Assistant Director (B&F), PTB
Member